സങ്കടമാണ്. ഒരു ന്യായവും നിയമവും പരമാർത്ഥവും ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിന്റെ വാദത്തിൽ ഇല്ല.

ഒരു മെമ്പർ നിയമം ലംഘിച്ചു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കണമെന്നു പറയുകയുണ്ടായി.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ്സ് ചാക്കാമുറി.—നിയമം ലംഘിക്കണമെന്നു ഞാൻ പറഞ്ഞില്ല. ബോർഡെടുത്തു കളയണമെന്നു മാത്രമേ പറഞ്ഞുള്ളു.

മിസ്റ്റർ കെ. അയ്യപ്പൻ—ലഹളകളുണ്ടാകുന്ന കാര്യത്തിൽ ഞാൻ അനുകൂലിയല്ല. അതിനു് ആരും ഇടവരുത്തരുതെന്നാണ് എനിയ്ക്കു പറയാനുള്ളതു. ട്രസ്റ്റിന്റെ കാര്യത്തിൽ ഒരു സംഗതികൂടി പറയാനുണ്ടു്. ട്രസ്റ്റു് ഒരു മതത്തെ സംബന്ധിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതല്ലേ. അയിത്തവും മറ്റും ഇനിയും വെച്ചുകൊണ്ടിരുന്നാൽ ആ മതത്തിനു് ഇനി നിലനിൽക്കേണ്ടോ? നമ്മുടെ അമ്പലവും ദേവനും മതവുമൊക്കെ തകരാൻ പോകുന്നതു ഓർക്കാത്തതെന്തുകൊണ്ടാണു്? മതത്തെ വെറുക്കുന്ന ആളുകളുടെ സംഖ്യകൂടിക്കൂടിവരികയാണു്.

'മാനം കുലധനം' എന്നു് മഹാരാജാവിന്റെ മുദ്രാവാക്യം ഈ സഭയിൽകൂടി എഴുതിവെച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടു്. അതാണു് തീണ്ടൽബോർഡല്ല ക്ഷേത്രമുമ്പിലും മറ്റും എഴുതിവെക്കേണ്ടതു്.

Resolution put and carried.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—*A poll, Sir.*

The House divided—Ayes 15,—Noes 11 and Neutral 1.

Ayes.

1. Mr. K. Ayyappan
2. ,, M. A. Chakko
3. ,, A. Eachara Menon
4. ,, E. Ikkanda Warriar
5. ,, Joseph Pettah
6. ,, P. S Kesavan Nambudiri
7. ,, George Chakyamuri
8. ,, P. Krishna Menon
9. Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan
10. ,, M. K. Raman
11. Dr. V. R. Menon
12. Mr. C. A. Ouseph
13. Mrs. Swaris
14. Mr. K. P. Vallon
15. ,, P. C. Varkey

Noes.

1. Mr. K. Achyuta Menon
2. ,, V. K. Aravindaksha Menon
3. ,, M. P. Cherian
4. ,, C. J. Mathew
5. ,, I. N Menon
6. ,, T. Narayana Menon
7. Mr. P. Nilakanta Menon
8. Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao
9. Rama Varmha Tampuran
10. Mr. P. V. Raphael
11. ,, Thomas Manjuran

Neutral.

Mr. A. Sankara Poduval

Appointment of a Committee to submit proposals for utilising the donation of 3 lakhs announced by His Highness.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, the resolution that I wish to place before the Government runs thus:

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

"This Council recommends to the Government that a small committee consisting of Officials and Non-officials be appointed to submit proposals to the Government as to the best methods of utilising the donation of three lakhs announced by His Highness in honour of the visit of His Excellency the Viceroy".

Sir, sometime ago we put a question in this House and we got a reply from the Secretary to the Diwan. But the Honourable Secretary has got the amazing capacity to answer questions without giving information and he delivered speeches without saying anything. We the simple folk understood that this Council will have a chance at least to discuss the proposals of the Government. Later on to our amazement we found out that we made a terrible mistake. Because due to his agility of mind the Hon'ble Secretary was able to wriggle out of the question by giving us that it could be interpreted in any way. We thought that a resolution openly brought forward before this House will neutralise the unfortunate position or to place us in a stronger position. That is why after the reply of the Secretary this resolution was introduced here. What is the resolution. Before we proceed let us clearly understand. In connection with the visit of His Excellency the Viceroy His Highness the Maharaja decided to donate three lakhs of rupees for public utility and public purposes. When this matter was brought to the notice of the Government and introduced it in the Council we requested that the proposals that the Government have in contemplation may be placed before this House and as I said we did not get any satisfactory reply from the Government. Now what is the objection in placing these proposals before us. There must have been a very reasonable ground that these proposals should not be placed before us. One argument was because this amount was donated by His Highness this Council has no right to effect any changes in it. Nobody claims that right. Nobody is anxious to reduce that amount. We know on the other side we have no such right to meddle with this question. But we claim the right, an equal right that is set up on that side, to tender our humble advice to His Highness our Maharaja, how his gracious donation should be utilised. We do not allow that you alone constitute the advisers of His Highness. We are here by our right to offer criticism, it may be constructive or it may be destructive. In a way it is an attempt to advise His Highness how things are going on in this House. That we can only do when the proposals are submitted in this House. We do not know how you are going to spend the money. Now there are two reasons for not placing it before this House, one is absolute incapacity of the Members on this side. Granted. Even then just to tickle our vanity and just to please us why not consult us.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Being incompetent you can place it before us without incurring any loss. To please others without incurring loss is very appealing to the generality of human beings But you do not seem to have it. On the other hand we may be in a position to render some advice. Again your attempt may sometimes fail. You remember there was a Leper Asylum built within two miles of Trichur. A committee was appointed during the time of Diwan Mr. Narayana Menon and he sent me a letter with the request that we should visit the place and give our opinion. The Civil Surgeon and Mr. K.Kochugovinda Marar the then Municipal Chairman were also the members of that Committee. We went independently and all the three recorded our opinion that apart from the scientific aspect of the question it is not the proper place to locate the Leper Asylum. There may be a difference of opinion from the scientific point of view but there cannot be a difference of opinion from the commonsense point of view. Who will advise the Government to construct a Leper Asylum within two miles of a growing town? That advice was given by the Government members. Therefore I say you gentlemen are likely to commit terrible mistakes, terrible blunders. Nearly one and a half lakhs was lost. That is the result. Those buildings stand to proclaim the incompetency, the carelessness, the indifference and the callousness with which public funds are wasted. I say deliberately wasted because no one in his sense would advise the erection of a Leper Asylum within two miles of the growing town of Trichur. All of them were sorry and Government were also sorry. But all the sorrows in the world will not rectify the mistake. But certain people even when they find that they have committed mistakes have a propensity to perpetuate the mistake. With due deference I must say that the Government members belong to that class. It is the secrecy in the matter that brings about all these. All the estimates have been prepared and there is a feverish haste to put up buildings. The Diwan Peishkar is running after acquisitions, the Chief Engineer making plans, and the Chief Medical Officer with a bundle of papers, carrying all these things secretly without the knowledge of this House. It would appear from these that if it is known to this House the whole thing would disappear like the Alladin's Wonderful Lamp. Do you not see the empty benches here? I was a member from the very inception of this House. This Council is dying slowly; the Members realise that it is a waste of time and waste of energy to come here and do the work. It is only when they realise that they have got certain rights and responsibilities that they will attend the Council. Without any right or responsibility they

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

do not think any useful purpose will be served by their coming here. And that is why we see empty benches. It is immaterial how we vote. Our vote carries no weight. Unless our opinion coincides with yours our protest is treated with contempt and indifference. Now do the Government realise that the Council Administration has done more harm than good in the State. Then it is your duty to bring these proposals before us. If on the other hand with all the limitations and with all the defects of this Legislative Council it has rendered some service to the people of the State then it is your duty not to treat this House with any contempt. Half a dozen on the other side do what they like.

If you can carry on these things without even consulting this Council, are we to come here to discuss about the question of a peon's pay or the raising of 2 as. travelling allowance to 6 as? Is it for that work that we come here? I cannot understand a graver blunder, a worse mistake that a sensible Government could commit than in getting these things beyond the purview of this House. Suppose you commit a mistake by consulting us at least you can come here and say that we are equally responsible. If, on the other hand, you do not consult us we can go on hammering that you spoiled the whole thing as I do now in the case of the Leper Asylum. If you are honest why do you apprehend that we will offer unreasonable opposition? Why? Because you yourself are not clear about it. It is all the working of the mind. If a man's mind works properly and if he is actuated by public benefit and public utility, he is not afraid to commit mistakes. He will openly commit mistakes. It is only when subtle things take place and your mind is working in a vicious circle pretending one thing outside and thinking another inside then comes the difficulty and you want to hush up things. Are you in that state? If you are not in that state, then you have no justification whatsoever in not bringing this to this House. Do you think that your prestige would be suffered by consulting us. Your prestige will not be suffered by consulting us and our prestige will to a very great extent be suffered by not consulting us. Because you have no trust in our capacity, we have no right to be here. It is for the Government to decide this question. The money is only three lakhs. You do not care if you waste it or spend it. But at least there is this consolation that we have rendered proper advice. Therefore I again ask this House to jointly vote with me for this proposition so that we can at least keep our self-respect, our prestige, and leave the Government to do what they please.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, I support the resolution. We are thankful to His Highness' Government for having set apart three lakhs of rupees for the benefit of the Hospitals in the State. I think that is the precise wording accompanying the benevolent grant. We, Sir, have a right to ask, as the beneficiaries of the grant, where and how this money is going to be spent, whether it is going to be squandered or whether it is going to be spent for the real use of the people. We spend a lot of money for the elections and get ourselves returned, a thankless task, thinking that we can be of some use to the Government through the advicee that we think we are qualified to give. But the Government Bench or at least some in that block think otherwise. Unfortunately for you we are trained watch-dogs with a developed power of scenting.

The other day, we, at Trichur, were taken a back by the news—I shall come to the point directly without going round and round like my Hon'ble Friend the Member for Cheruturuthi that the Hospital at Trichur is going to be taken away to a place far away from Trichur. I believe that was one of the things behind the motion of the Hon'ble Member for Cheruthuruthy. We, as citizens of the State, we, as the ratepayers of Trichur, have a right to be heard in this matter. The present Chief Medical Officer may be the wisest man in his line. He may be the ablest, but does he know the poor man's difficulties? No, he does not know it. His administration of the department hitherto has been a failure. I would put it bluntly that he is the last man, if one man would be consulted, to whom the distribution of this fund could be entrusted. The Chief Medical Officer has always moved, God blessing, in a very high circle. It has never been his lot to move among the populace. He does not know their needs. Are we wrong in saying that you should use these funds only after consulting the people. What is the best method of consulting them? Is it to ask the Chief Medical Officer to prepare scheme, plans and estimates and get everything ready for the Government to pass final orders? I understand that immediate acquisition proceedings are contemplated. Some sites at Olarikara are pitched upon as the best sites. But then for whom is this hospital? Is it for the people of Trichur or is it for the Government? We want to know for whom is this new Hospital going to be built. It is said that there is no site available in Trichur for development. We do not want to develop always by area. There is room for development high up in the air and there the air is better. In America, in New York, especially—I have not gone there—it is said there are buildings of several storeys. Why do they do put up such

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

buildings? Can't they go to the Rockies and build hospitals there? It is unquestioned that the present site is one of the best available sites in Trichur, and the most central. On the question of being centrally situated nothing can be said against the present hospital. I learnt a few minutes back from the Member for Cheruthuruthi that some of the best and most famous hospitals in London are situated amidst the worst slums of the city.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—It is a fact.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Why not Trichur have its hospital in the present site? If it can't extend in area, why not extend upwards? Why should it be carried far away from the heart of the town? Perhaps my constituency will be benefitted a little if it is carried westwards. But, Sir, there is ample room for development at the present site. You have only to raise the buildings by two or three storeys. You may get any number of acres in the wilds. That is not the consideration. When you ask a patient to be taken to the hospital two or three miles away, the Government does not see what the poor tax-payer has to spend for carriage. Perhaps Government may have to spend initially a considerable amount for acquisition. But to whom does the benefit go?. Instead of making the tax-payer spend eternally for taking patients to that spot, why not you spend money at the present spot?

It is said that the maternity hospital requires extension. I do not know whether the Government has the idea, now that Dr. De Souza has been transferred to Trichur, to make it a bigger hospital, senior to the Hospital in Mattancheri

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Hear, hear.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—If there is an idea like this, well and good. I have no objection. But Sir, change of personalities need not change policies. Let us have some continuity, some consistency in this matter. Ladies cannot complain that they have no notice of the coming event. They have at least nine months' notice. The maternity hospital can therefore be safely removed. But what about other cases? The man or woman who has suddenly to be taken to the civil hospital has absolutely no notice. He or she has to be taken all on a sudden. Then what is to be done? The Chief Medical Officer may provide an ambulence car. With due respect to the Chairman of the Trichur Municipality how many times his water-lorry has gone out of order. How many times the water-lorry of the Police Commissioner has gone out of order? There may be an ambulence car. But if the car is out of order, if the driver is not available, what will be the condition of the patient? So that Sir, the policy ought to be to make the hospital always and easily available to the majority of the people. Have it in the most

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

central place. Of course site is available every where. Cochin is 1,600 square miles.

Deputy President.—You are now going on to the Trichur Hospital. Confine yourself to the resolution

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—That is one of the items proposed for improvement.

President.—Try to come to the point.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Therefore I say, before anything is decided upon either with regard to the Trichur Hospital or with regard to any other, the view of the people, official and non-official, should be ascertained and matters ought to be so devised that the highest good may be obtained from the grant so graciously made by His Highness

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—Sir, before we proceed any further shall we know whether there is any truth in the statement regarding the transfer of the Trichur Hospital?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, mine was only a general statement.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Sir, may we know whether there are any tangible proposals?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Sir, the Government view on this resolution is as follows. But before I proceed I shall place before the House the present proposals that have been forwarded to the Government. These proposals were made in consultation with the Chief Engineer and they are as follows—Out of the three lakhs that has been given for the improvement of the Hospitals, the schemeas it stands gives the Trichur Civil Hospital one lakh and 90 thousand rupees.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—On a point of order, Sir, I want a ruling on the point whether after reading the proposals can we make use of that fact for further speeches?

Deputy President.—The point is, if the Government has already come to a definite plan, is it necessary to discuss the resolution? Is it finally settled? There is no use in giving lot of estimates. You must confine yourself to the resolution.

Rama Varmha Tampuran.—Every Member has got a freedom of reply.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The specific question that I raised is whether this Council will be allowed to go through the proposals of the Government or not. The answer is either yes or no.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—The Hon'ble Member for Cheruthuruthy has brought aresolution. The Official Member in charge wants to explain. Nobody has the right to restrict him as to how he should explain.

Deputy President.—There is the resolution before you. You must confine to the resolution. You are not to go outside it.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Rama Varmha Tampuran.—Sir, cannot a Member have freedom to present a case as he likes best? He may be presenting a point which may be difficult to grasp. He will point out afterwards the relation of that point to the general one. These are all tactics of debate. One should not hamper with the freedom of presenting a case. On that depends a good deal. Administrative problems may not be so simple as to say yes or no.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The moment the Member began to read out the estimates I raised a point of order and I pray that a ruling may be given.

Mr. A. Sankara Poduval.—Sir, the question of withdrawing the resolution is not before the House. So the Government Member gives what he has to say and it is not for us to consider whether the reasons are sound or not.

Deputy President.—I insist upon the speech being confined to the subject-matter of the resolution.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I did not ask for the specific items. What I had asked was, are the Government going to consult us or not. It is a matter of prestige with us. Are we to be consulted or are we not?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—On a point of order, Sir.

Deputy President.—One and all of you are raising point of orders. But you are not heeding to what I say. Let me hear what you have to say.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—In regard to this resolution when the Member has moved that a Committee should be appointed is it not open to the Government Member to make out that a Committee is not necessary by bringing to the notice of the House that the grants have been made in such a manner as not to deserve it?

Deputy President.—The Government should say whether they are opposing it or not.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Government is opposing the resolution.

Deputy President.—That is all right. You may go on with your speech.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Government have formulated a scheme though final orders have not been passed. The scheme as it is, is as follows. I shall read before the House the scheme if the House wants it. As I said before out of the three lakhs a sum of rupees one lakh and ninety thousand have been set apart for the improvement of the Civil Hospital at Trichur. A doubt was brought here whether the Civil Hospital is going to be shunted out. I may inform the House that the Civil Hospital is not going to be shunted. It is going to be located, if possible, within

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the town in a more extensivespace because as it stands at present the Civil Hospital has got very little space. It is bounded on all sides by roads. It is impossible to improve the institution there. Trichur requires a large and better institution and therefore in order to provide better facilities for the poor patients it is going to be shifted to a more suitable place. Of course I do not want to make any reply to the personal aspersions. I must say this much. In order to provide better facilities for the poor patients, I thought that it is better in the interests of the town that the Hospital should be shifted to a more extensive ground and in the acquisition of this site the Diwan Peishkar and the Chairman of the Municipality will be consulted.

The next Hospital that is going to be benefitted is the Mattancheri male hospital, for which a provision of about 60 thousand rupees has been made. The General Hospital is to have 65 thousand for the construction of an out-patient department and a maternity and children's ward.

	Cost Rs.	Rs.
Kunnamkulam Hospital		
Out-patient building	9,000	9,000
Irinjalakkuda Hospital		
Labour ward	4,600	
Acquisition	2,000	
Operation room	4 800	11,400
Narakkal Dispensary		
Out-patient ward	9,000	
Latrines	600	
Emergency ward	5,500	15,100
Kanniode Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5,500
Kozhinjanpara Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5,500
Palayannur Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5 500
Chowwara Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5,500
Mala Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5,500
Adthikad Dispensary		
Emergency ward	5,500	5 000
Nemmara Hospital		
Operaion theatre	5,000	5.500
Chittur Hospital		
Operation theatre	5,000	
Ward of 12 beds	5,500	10.500
Cranganur Hospital		
Improvements	1,000	
Providing vernadahs on the two sides of the new wards	350	
Nurses' Quarters	2,650	4,000

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—Is there nothing for Pudukad Dispensary?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No. For carrying out these proposals Government do not think that a Committee is necessary.

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—Sir, after hearing the Government position, I find there are greater reasons to support the Resolution than ever before. The resolution goes on a general question. The position taken up by the non-official members on this side is that in such a matter as this they had a right to be consulted. They requested to be consulted and there was some sort of an understanding given, though perhaps it was not so expressly given, but it was understood on this side of the House that a promise was given that in the disposal of this three lakhs of rupees the House will be consulted. So there is first of all the general point that the suggestion made by this House has been simply ignored. (Hear, hear). Therefore in order to maintain the prestige of the non-official section of this House this resolution has to be carried. We have to be given a chance of having our say with regard to the way in which this fund is going to be utilised. That is the basic principle underlying this Resolution.

Now another thing. After hearing how the amount is going to be disposed of we find that the apprehension raised by one Hon'ble Member is not entirely in vain. There is some foundation behind it all, that is with reference to the Hospital at Trichur. That being one of the items in the scheme prepared by the Government and because that particular item is not acceptable so far as I think to the people of Trichur, this Resolution has to be moved so that a new scheme has to be prepared. The Trichur Hospital is in a busy place, every-body would admit. So also are the hospitals of big cities. In Bombay the General Hospital is in a very busy place. In Madras it is in the busiest place, just besides the Central Station. Is it because the Madras Government have no other suitable place to shift that hospital that the hospital has been maintained there? Compared to the hospital of Madras we have got a bigger compound. Cosidering the space the Madras General Hospital also is lacking in space and they have tried to make it up by building upwards. They found that they could not expand sideways and so they have built three or four storeys and the patients are taken to the place even by lifts. That could be adopted in Trichur also. An Hospital must be accessible to all. It is no use to have an hospital in an out of the way place. The site in Trichur is not a very bad one. But if you consider other aspects this is one of the ideal places. There is the temple Maidan just

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

in front and there is no prospect of that being crowded. You get fresh breezes from the expanded area at all times of the day. If there is any want of superficial or surface area it could be made up by putting up new storeys. Where is the necessity therefore to shift the Hospital to another place. It is done in the interests of the people. That was the contention of the Chief Medical Officer. In suchmatters before a proposal was made was it not at least reasonable that the people of Trichur should be consulted. There is the Municipal Council. The matter could have been brought to their notice, whether they would like any shifting of the hospital to another place. If the people did not like the idea, why should the Chief Medical Officer be so solicitous in the interests of the people of Trichur to give them what they do not want. You ask for bread and you give stone. The people are not anxious to have it shifted. If another place equally central can be found, there is not much objection. But as it is that place is an ideal site. The premises of the hospital has no chance of being crowded even at a distant future as the extensive ground belongs to the Devaswam. Therefore the solicitude of the Chief Medical Officer in the interests of the people of Trichur is an ill-placed or ill-founded solicitude. It is not going to benefit the beneficiaries. I am sure if the matter is placed before the Municipal Council, they would come to a decision that the present site of the hospital should be adhered to. Apart from any of the items of the particular scheme that has been placed before the House, apart from the merits and demerits of this particular scheme the very fact that the members of this House has not been given a chance to have their say on the disposal of this amount is sufficient justification for a resolution of this sort. We want that we should be given a chance. We request for it. The Government had given us something of an assurance. After everything was over, Government comes and says that we have already formulated a scheme and that a discussion of that scheme or to go into the merits or the demerits of the scheme is not necessary. This is something of an outrage done to this Council. It is flouting the very wishes of this Council. The matter is sufficiently serious that we must have a say on this matter. If we go through the items also we find the justification for a Committee. For both these reasons I support the resolution.

The House rose for the day at 5. p. m.

C. J. MATHEW,

Secretary to the Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly